



Marion County Alliance of Neighborhood Associations

2005 MDC Report

Attendance and Voting Record of the Metropolitan Development Commissioners from January through October, 2005

released November 30, 2005



Metropolitan Development Commission Zoning Votes
 January 1, 2005 to October 31, 2005

OVERALL RESULTS FOR ALL COMMISSIONERS

Special Use Petitions

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
42	42	0	100
Data from 2004 Study:			97

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
53	51	2	96
Data from 2004 Study:			96

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
63	57	6	90
Data from 2004 Study:			94

Withdrawn Petitions (not included in totals above)

# petitions	# SU	# fit comp plan	# not fit comp plan	some petitions were withdrawn before a staff report was issued, thus we do not know if the proposed zoning complied with the comprehensive plan
21	3	3	6	

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD BY THE MDC January through October

Special Use Petitions

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
4	4	0	100
Data from 2004 Study:			75

Petitions that fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
9	8	1	89
Data from 2004 Study:			67

Petitions that do not fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
20	16	4	80
Data from 2004 Study:			86

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by the MDC in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
21	18	3	86

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# approved	# denied	% approved
11	9	2	82

Sylvia Trotter – MDC Commissioner Appointed by Mayor

ATTENDENCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Ms. Trotter attended	# meetings Ms. Trotter missed	% meetings Ms. Trotter attended
20	18	2	90

Hearings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Ms. Trotter attended	# hearings Ms. Trotter missed or recused herself	% hearings Ms. Trotter attended
33	27	6	82

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Ms. Trotter JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Ms. Trotter voted to approve	# Ms. Trotter voted to deny	% Ms. Trotter voted to approve
3	3	0	100

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Ms. Trotter voted to approve	# Ms. Trotter voted to deny	% Ms. Trotter voted to approve
7	6	1	86

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Ms. Trotter voted to approve	# Ms. Trotter voted to deny	% Ms. Trotter voted to approve
17	12	5	71

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Ms. Trotter in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Ms. Trotter voted to approve	# Ms. Trotter voted to deny	% Ms. Trotter voted to approve
17	13	4	76

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Ms. Trotter voted to approve	# Ms. Trotter voted to deny	% Ms. Trotter voted to approve
9	7	2	78

Ms. Trotter's VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Ms. Trotter voted to approve	# Ms. Trotter voted to deny	% Ms. Trotter voted to approve
2	2	0	100

McANA makes no recommendation on the re-appointment of Sylvia Trotter to the MDC.

The Mayor has appointed too many Democrats to the MDC. State law requires no more than 2 be of the same political party. The Mayor's compliance with State law is absolutely necessary.

Ms. Trotter voted to approve 25 of the 34 petitions she heard in 2004. There is little or no change her positions in 2005. The 2005 data indicates that Ms. Trotter placed modest, but insufficient, weight on the Comprehensive Plan, but no evidence that she weighed staff recommendation heavily. Ms. Trotter voted to approve both petitions she heard that were ultimately denied by the City-County Council. If reappointed, McANA hopes to find better implementation of the Comprehensive Plan and stronger support of Staff recommendations in 2006.

Edward Treacy – MDC Commissioner Appointed by Mayor

ATTENDENCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Mr. Treacy attended	# meetings Mr. Treacy missed	% meetings Mr. Treacy attended
20	17	3	85

Hearings– If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Mr. Treacy attended	# hearings Mr. Treacy missed or recused himself	% hearings Mr. Treacy attended
33	22	11	67

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Treacy JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Mr. Treacy voted to approve	# Mr. Treacy voted to deny	% Mr. Treacy voted to approve
4	3	1	75

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Treacy voted to approve	# Mr. Treacy voted to deny	% Mr. Treacy voted to approve
9	5	4	56

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Treacy voted to approve	# Mr. Treacy voted to deny	% Mr. Treacy voted to approve
9	7	2	78

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Treacy in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Mr. Treacy voted to approve	# Mr. Treacy voted to deny	% Mr. Treacy voted to approve
17	11	6	65

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Mr. Treacy voted to approve	# Mr. Treacy voted to deny	% Mr. Treacy voted to approve
4	3	1	75

Mr. Treacy's VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Mr. Treacy voted to approve	# Mr. Treacy voted to deny	% Mr. Treacy voted to approve
3	2	1	67

McANA strongly recommends that Edward Treacy not be re-appointed to the MDC.

The Mayor has appointed too many Democrats to the MDC. State law requires no more than 2 be of the same political party. The Mayor's compliance with State law is absolutely necessary.

Mr. Treacy is currently the Chairman of the Marion County Democratic Central Committee. As McANA has stated for the last several years, his simultaneous service on the MDC is unseemly at best and provokes concern among neighborhoods that decisions of the MDC are politically motivated. Mr. Treacy does recuse himself from voting on petitions presented by attorneys from Bose McKinney, the law firm with which he co-owns Bose-Treacy, but fails to do so with Thomas Michael Quinn, a heavy donor to the MCDCC. This appears to be a conflict of interest.

At first blush the 2005 data seems to suggest improvement in Mr. Treacy's voting record over 2004 when voted to approve 25 of the 25 petitions he heard. A closer look, though, shows Mr. Treacy voted to deny more and a greater percentage of petitions that fit the Comp Plan than those that did not fit the Plan. The 2005 data suggests that Mr. Treacy placed no weight on the Comprehensive Plan, and no evidence that he weighed staff recommendations to any real extent.

Mr. Treacy had the third lowest attendance at meetings of the Commissioners and heard the second lowest percentage of petitions.

Robert Shula – MDC Commissioner Appointed by City-County Council

ATTENDENCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Mr. Shula attended	# meetings Mr. Shula missed	% meetings Mr. Shula attended
7	7	0	100

Hearings– If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Mr. Shula attended	# hearings Mr. Shula missed or recused himself	% hearings Mr. Shula attended
8	6	2	75

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Shula JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Mr. Shula voted to approve	# Mr. Shula voted to deny	% Mr. Shula voted to approve
0			

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Shula voted to approve	# Mr. Shula voted to deny	% Mr. Shula voted to approve
2	2	0	100

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Shula voted to approve	# Mr. Shula voted to deny	% Mr. Shula voted to approve
4	4	0	100

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Shula in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Mr. Shula voted to approve	# Mr. Shula voted to deny	% Mr. Shula voted to approve
2	2	0	100

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Mr. Shula voted to approve	# Mr. Shula voted to deny	% Mr. Shula voted to approve
4	4	0	100

Mr. Shula's VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Mr. Shula voted to approve	# Mr. Shula voted to deny	% Mr. Shula voted to approve
0			

McANA makes no recommendation on the re-appointment of Robert Shula to the MDC.

Mr. Shula was just recently appointed to the MDC and there is insufficient data to draw any conclusions at this point in time.

Brian Murphy– MDC Commissioner Appointed by City-County Council

ATTENDENCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Mr. Murphy attended	# meetings Mr. Murphy missed	% meetings Mr. Murphy attended
20	18	2	90

Hearings– If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Mr. Murphy attended	# hearings Mr. Murphy missed or recused himself	% hearings Mr. Murphy attended
33	28	5	85

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Murphy JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Mr. Murphy voted to approve	# Mr. Murphy voted to deny	% Mr. Murphy voted to approve
4	3	1	75

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Murphy voted to approve	# Mr. Murphy voted to deny	% Mr. Murphy voted to approve
9	8	1	89

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Murphy voted to approve	# Mr. Murphy voted to deny	% Mr. Murphy voted to approve
15	12	3	80

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Murphy in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Mr. Murphy voted to approve	# Mr. Murphy voted to deny	% Mr. Murphy voted to approve
19	16	3	84

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Mr. Murphy voted to approve	# Mr. Murphy voted to deny	% Mr. Murphy voted to approve
8	6	2	75

Mr. Murphy's VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Mr. Murphy voted to approve	# Mr. Murphy voted to deny	% Mr. Murphy voted to approve
3	2	1	67

McANA makes no recommendation on the re-appointment of Brian Murphy to the MDC.

Mr. Murphy's voting record in 2005 was no different from 2004 when he voted to approve 22 of the 28 petitions he heard. The 2005 data suggest that Mr. Murphy placed modest, but insufficient, weight on the Comprehensive Plan, and a little evidence that he weighed staff recommendation. Mr. Murphy voted to approve 2 of the 3 petitions he heard that were ultimately denied by the City-County Council. If reappointed, McANA hopes to find better implementation of the Comprehensive Plan and stronger support of Staff recommendations in 2006.

Lee Marble – MDC Commissioner Appointed by Mayor

ATTENDENCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Mr. Marble attended	# meetings Mr. Marble missed	% meetings Mr. Marble attended
20	19	1	95

Hearings– If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Mr. Marble attended	# hearings Mr. Marble missed or recused himself	% hearings Mr. Marble attended
33	33	0	100

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Marble JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Mr. Marble voted to approve	# Mr. Marble voted to deny	% Mr. Marble voted to approve
4	4	0	100

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Marble voted to approve	# Mr. Marble voted to deny	% Mr. Marble voted to approve
9	8	1	89

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Marble voted to approve	# Mr. Marble voted to deny	% Mr. Marble voted to approve
20	15	5	75

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Marble in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Mr. Marble voted to approve	# Mr. Marble voted to deny	% Mr. Marble voted to approve
21	16	5	76

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Mr. Marble voted to approve	# Mr. Marble voted to deny	% Mr. Marble voted to approve
11	10	1	91

Mr. Marble's VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Mr. Marble voted to approve	# Mr. Marble voted to deny	% Mr. Marble voted to approve
3	2	1	67

McANA makes no recommendation on the re-appointment of Lee Marble to the MDC.

The Mayor has appointed too many Democrats to the MDC. State law requires no more than 2 be of the same political party. The Mayor's compliance with State law is absolutely necessary.

Mr. Marble's voting record in 2005 worsened from 2004 when he voted to approve 17 of the 25 petitions he heard. The 2005 data suggest that Mr. Marble placed modest, but insufficient, weight on the Comprehensive Plan, but no evidence that he weighed staff recommendation to any significant extent. Mr. Marble voted to approve 2 of the 3 petitions he heard that were ultimately denied by the City-County Council. If reappointed, McANA hopes to find better implementation of the Comprehensive Plan and stronger support of Staff recommendations in 2006.

Robert Kennedy – MDC Commissioner Appointed by City-County Council

ATTENDENCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Mr. Kennedy attended	# meetings Mr. Kennedy missed	% meetings Mr. Kennedy attended
20	19	1	95

Hearings– If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Mr. Kennedy attended	# hearings Mr. Kennedy missed or recused himself	% hearings Mr. Kennedy attended
33	33	0	100

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Kennedy JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Mr. Kennedy voted to approve	# Mr. Kennedy voted to deny	% Mr. Kennedy voted to approve
4	2	2	50

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Kennedy voted to approve	# Mr. Kennedy voted to deny	% Mr. Kennedy voted to approve
9	9	0	100

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Kennedy voted to approve	# Mr. Kennedy voted to deny	% Mr. Kennedy voted to approve
20	9	11	45

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Kennedy in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Mr. Kennedy voted to approve	# Mr. Kennedy voted to deny	% Mr. Kennedy voted to approve
21	17	4	81

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Mr. Kennedy voted to approve	# Mr. Kennedy voted to deny	% Mr. Kennedy voted to approve
11	3	8	27

Mr. Kennedy's VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Mr. Kennedy voted to approve	# Mr. Kennedy voted to deny	% Mr. Kennedy voted to approve
3	0	3	0

McANA strongly recommends that Robert Kennedy be re-appointed to the MDC.

Mr. Kennedy's voting record in 2005 was little changed from 2004 when he voted to approve 10 of the 16 petitions he heard. The 2005 data suggest that Mr. Kennedy placed appropriate weight on the Comprehensive Plan. He was the only Commissioner who voted to deny a majority of the petitions he heard that did not fit the Comprehensive Plan. In addition, there is significant evidence that he weighed staff recommendation heavily, again being the only Commissioner who voted to deny a majority of the petitions he heard for which Staff recommended denial. Mr. Kennedy voted to deny all three of the petitions he heard that were ultimately denied by the City-County Council.

James Curtis, Jr. – MDC Commissioner Appointed by County Commissioners

ATTENDANCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Mr. Curtis attended	# meetings Mr. Curtis missed	% meetings Mr. Curtis attended
20	16	4	80

Hearings– If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Mr. Curtis attended	# hearings Mr. Curtis missed or recused himself	% hearings Mr. Curtis attended
33	25	8	76

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Curtis JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Mr. Curtis voted to approve	# Mr. Curtis voted to deny	% Mr. Curtis voted to approve
4	4	0	100

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Curtis voted to approve	# Mr. Curtis voted to deny	% Mr. Curtis voted to approve
7	6	1	86

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Curtis voted to approve	# Mr. Curtis voted to deny	% Mr. Curtis voted to approve
14	12	2	86

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Curtis in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Mr. Curtis voted to approve	# Mr. Curtis voted to deny	% Mr. Curtis voted to approve
17	14	3	82

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Mr. Curtis voted to approve	# Mr. Curtis voted to deny	% Mr. Curtis voted to approve
7	7	0	100

Mr. Curtis' VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Mr. Curtis voted to approve	# Mr. Curtis voted to deny	% Mr. Curtis voted to approve
3	2	1	67

McANA strongly recommends that James Curtis, Jr., not be re-appointed to the MDC.

Mr. Curtis' voting record in 2005 was slightly improved over 2004 when he voted to approve 24 of the 25 petitions he heard. The 2005 data suggest that Mr. Curtis placed no weight on the Comprehensive Plan, and no evidence that he weighed staff recommendation to any extent. Mr. Curtis voted to approve 2 of the 3 petitions that were ultimately denied by the City County Council.

Mr. Curtis had the second lowest attendance at meetings of the Commissioners and heard the third lowest percentage of petitions (excluding Mr. Shula for insufficient data).

John Bales – MDC Commissioner Appointed by County Commissioners

ATTENDANCE

Meetings – If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 20 meetings possible

# meetings possible	# meetings Mr. Bales attended	# meetings Mr. Bales missed	% meetings Mr. Bales attended
20	14	6	70

Hearings– If an appointment was begun mid-year, there will be fewer than 33 zoning hearings possible

# hearings possible	# hearings Mr. Bales attended	# hearings Mr. Bales missed or recused himself	% hearings Mr. Bales attended
33	20	13	61

Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Bales JANUARY 1, 2005 TO OCTOBER 31, 2005

Special Use

# petitions	# Mr. Bales voted to approve	# Mr. Bales voted to deny	% Mr. Bales voted to approve
3	3	0	100

Petitions that Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Bales voted to approve	# Mr. Bales voted to deny	% Mr. Bales voted to approve
5	5	0	100

Petitions that Do Not Fit the Comprehensive Plan

# petitions	# Mr. Bales voted to approve	# Mr. Bales voted to deny	% Mr. Bales voted to approve
12	9	3	75

STAFF RECOMMENDATION for Zoning PETITIONS HEARD by Mr. Bales in 2005

Staff Recommended Approval

# petitions	# Mr. Bales voted to approve	# Mr. Bales voted to deny	% Mr. Bales voted to approve
13	11	2	85

Staff Recommended Denial

# petitions	# Mr. Bales voted to approve	# Mr. Bales voted to deny	% Mr. Bales voted to approve
6	5	1	83

Mr. Bales' VOTE ON PETITIONS OVERTURNED BY CITY-COUNTY COUNCIL 2005

# petitions	# Mr. Bales voted to approve	# Mr. Bales voted to deny	% Mr. Bales voted to approve
1	1	0	100

McANA strongly recommends that John Bales not be re-appointed to the MDC.

Mr. Bales' voting record in 2005 shows little or no change from 2004, when he voted to approve 19 of the 23 petitions. The 2005 data suggests that Mr. Bales placed slight, but insufficient, weight on the Comprehensive Plan, but there is no evidence that he weighed staff recommendation heavily. Mr. Bales voted to approve the only petition he heard that was ultimately denied by the City-County Council.

Mr. Bales had the lowest attendance at meetings of the Commissioners and heard the lowest percentage of petitions.